科技部補助專題研究計畫成果報告
期末報告

感動服務人才培養之研究

計 畫 主 持 人 ： 王怡潔

計畫參與人員： 大專生-兼任助理：蔡依捷

中 華 民 國 107 年 08 月 20 日

中文摘要： 在21世紀，為了維持與顧客長久的關係，感動服務已儼然成為服務業的新標竿。雖然顧客感動的研究主題已吸引許多學者投入，但在感動服務能力與態度培訓方式的研究則尚欠缺。學者指出因為提供感動服務所需的能力與態度很難藉由一般教室型式的訓練課程培育出來，所以有效培育機制的研究便更顯重要。本研究經由與10位飯店資深私人管家與人力資源部門培訓部主管深入訪談，歸納幾點發現。首先，我們系統性地將服務人員提供感動服務所須具備的能力與態度歸納為3個層級；此外，我們建議最有效的訓練方式便是營造一個顧客導向，服務導向的企業環境氛圍，讓服務人員隨時隨地沉浸在顧客導向的氛圍中，日積月累，耳濡目染便能將服務人員塑形成為具備感動服務理念的人才。最後，我們建議角色扮演、情境模擬、互動訓練、教練訓練機制、以及角色模範等是在營造顧客導向的企業氛圍上較為有效的訓練機制。

中文關鍵詞： 顧客感動，人力資源管理，服務氛圍，教練訓練機制，角色模範

英文摘要： In the 21st century, delightful service has become the new service standard to ensure long-term customer retention. Although customer delight has been thoroughly studied, studies have not explored training methods for developing essential abilities in service employees. Researchers have argued that it is vital to discover effective training methods, especially because the abilities and attitudes that are required to deliver delightful services are relatively difficult to develop in traditional classroom settings. Several findings are discovered through in-depth interviews with ten butlers and human resources training managers at hotels. First, this study systematically organized the essential abilities and attitudes of employees into 3 levels. Then, we propose that the most effective training method is to immerse employees in a customer-oriented service environment. Role playing, playing interactive games, coaching, and role modeling are identified to be useful for building a customer-oriented service environment within a company.

英文關鍵詞： Customer delight, Human resources management, Service climate, Coaching, Role modeling

Fostering Exceptional Service Employees: Learning from Examples

Abstract

In the 21st century, delightful service has become the new service standard to ensure long-term customer retention. Although customer delight has been thoroughly studied, studies have not explored training methods for developing essential abilities in service employees. Researchers have argued that it is vital to discover effective training methods, especially because the abilities and attitudes that are required to deliver delightful services are relatively difficult to develop in traditional classroom settings. Several findings are discovered through in-depth interviews with ten butlers and human resources training managers at hotels. First, this study systematically organized the essential abilities and attitudes of employees into 3 levels. Then, we propose that the most effective training method is to immerse employees in a customer-oriented service environment. Role playing, playing interactive games, coaching, and role modeling are identified to be useful for building a customer-oriented service environment within a company.

1. Introduction

Service innovation is inevitable for surviving in today's service industry, where customers have become increasingly demanding and sophisticated. The traditional style of customer service, such as providing reactive service, responding to visible needs, and delivering universally standard service, is no longer adequate for satisfying and retaining customers. To sustain competitiveness, companies must win over customers by making a positive impression, which helps foster brand loyalty (Akbar & Som, 2011; Barber, Goodman, & Goh 2011; Tsai, 2014). Customers' positive impressions of a company are mostly developed through providing services that exceed their expectations (Berry, Wall, & Carbone, 2006), which promotes a delightful state of mind. The concept of customer delight has been rigorously studied for decades. Customer delight is defined as customers' reactions to a product or service that has provided an unanticipated level of value or satisfaction (Crotts & Magnini, 2011). Customer delight is suggested to be an emotion-laden construct that

outperforms the cognitive elements of experiences and leaves enduring memories in customers' minds (Mattila, 2006; Oliver, 1999). Therefore, numerous researchers have emphasized the emotional aspects of customer delight. For example, Patterson (1997) defined delight as a customer's experience that goes beyond satisfaction and involves pleasure. Kumar, Olshavsky, and King (2001) suggested that customer delight is composed of joy, thrill, and exhilaration. Because delighted customers experience relatively intense positive feelings, researchers have proposed that customer delight provides memorable experiences (Kumar et al., 2001; Torres & Kline, 2006) and is strongly associated with customer loyalty. Kim (2011) suggested that "customer delight seems to have a stronger impact on affective loyalty when compared to customer satisfaction." Torres and Kline (2013) proposed that "delighting customers, rather than satisfying them, is a better way to engage guests and ensure loyalty." Therefore, delighted customers are more likely to become loyal toward the companies that have delighted them (Gilmore & Pine, 1999; Torres & Kline, 2013) and are more likely to repurchase from and recommend them (Gilmore & Pine, 1999).

In the long history of research on customer delight, various aspects have been studied rigorously, namely the structure (Finn, 2005; Kumar et al., 2001; Oliver, Rust, & Varki, 1997; Patterson, 1997;), drivers (Barnes, Ponder, & Dugar, 2011; Crotts, Pan, & Raschind, 2008; Torres & Kline, 2013; Torres, Fu, & Lehto, 2014), and results of delight (Finn, 2005; Kim, 2011; Kumar et al., 2001; Patterson, 1997). Scholars have identified several types of service encounters that delight customers. For example, Arnold, Reynolds, Ponder, and Lueg (2005) identified several conditions that delight customers, including employees going beyond the scope of their company's policies to accommodate customers' requirements and employees spending a considerable amount of time assisting customers while being exceptionally friendly, nice, and not too aggressive or pushy. Barnes et al. (2011) claimed that employee actions (i.e., smiling, caring, and other personality factors), employee effort in making customers feel valued, and enhancing customers' self-esteem are crucial routes to customer delight. These findings reinforce the pertinence of service employees in delivering delightful service.

The abilities and attitudes of service employees are undoubtedly imperative factors for providing delightful service. Ap and Wong (2001) proposed three dimensions of a service employee's professionalism: impressive product knowledge,

effective communication skills, and the right attitude (i.e., service oriented). Kang and Hyun (2012) presented four dimensions of customer-oriented behaviors: technical skills, social skills, motivation, and self-perceived decision-making authority. To summarize, three essential abilities, namely service employees' sensitivity and observation skills (Hasin, Seeluangsawat, & Shareef, 2001; Mattila & Enz, 2002; Teng, 2011), their ability to read customers' emotions to provide appropriate service responses (Bitner, Brown, & Meuter, 2000; Menon & Dube, 2000; Tung, 2012; Wang & Beise-Zee, 2013), and going beyond the call of duty to provide attentive and customized services (Arnold et al., 2005; Gremler & Gwinner, 2000, 2008) are proposed by scholars that might advance service quality to an exceptional level.

Although numerous studies have examined customer delight, little is known regarding how to train service employees to flawlessly deliver services that delight customers. The various technical skills (e.g., the ability to detect customers' needs and emotions) and attitudes (e.g., empathy, attentiveness, and proactiveness) required to deliver delightful service are not feasible and cannot be easily taught in traditional classroom settings. However, knowledge sharing and imparting skills are critical to every organization for ensuring that valuable intellectual knowledge is maintained within the organization and that it is given to new employees, so that they are capable of delivering exceptional service to prevent fluctuations in service quality. Few studies have investigated this aspect of delightful service. Therefore, how service personnel should be trained to deliver delightful service remains unclear. It is critical for service companies to establish systematic training programs to enable valuable corporate knowledge and professional skills to be passed onto new staff to transform average service employees into service experts. Service innovation is feasible only through such training programs. This study examined various training methods for developing frontline service employees' abilities and attitudes to deliver delightful service.

A qualitative study was conducted by interviewing experienced and renowned butlers at five-star hotels to learn how they became successful. Senior human resources (HR) training managers at five-star hotels were also interviewed to discover effective methods for training service employees. The results of this study contribute to the literature on customer delight, service quality, and HR management by revealing effective training methods for developing exceptional service personnel. By learning from experienced hotel butlers, this study may assist industry practitioners in

training their employees to become service experts. The results of this study may also elevate service quality in the hotel and service industry in Taiwan.

2. Literature Review

To satisfy 21st-century customers who are not only seeking cognitive or practical benefits but also emotional or hedonic satisfaction from every shopping experience, service employees at the individual level and company support systems at the organizational level must work together to deliver a seamless, delightful, and unforgettable customer experience.

2.1 Customer Delight

In today's competitive business world, an emotion-laden element of customer delight is suggested to outperform satisfaction to maintain sustainable customer relationships, to attain customer loyalty, and to increase company profitability.

Kim (2011) suggested that customer delight seems to have a stronger impact on affective loyalty when compared with customer satisfaction. Torres and Kline (2013) further claim that "delighting customers, rather than satisfying them, is a better way to engage guests and ensure loyalty." Therefore, the concept of customer delight has recently been proposed as a means for reaching an ultimate level of customer satisfaction and hence maintaining long-term customer relationships. Most definitions of customer delight have emphasized the emotional state of customers. For example, Oliver et al. (1997) proposed that "customer delight refers to a profoundly positive emotional state generally resulting from having one's expectations exceeded to a surprising degree." In other words, customer delight is the pleasurable mental state customers experience after receiving products or services that have exceeded their expectations.

Regarding the drivers of customer delight, Barnes et al. (2011) proposed two routes: a cognitive route, when customers are able to formulate accurate expectations, and an affective route, when customers are unable to clearly define their expectations. They further proposed that employees' efforts and skills and core product and service recovery are used in customers' cognitive evaluations; the affective route can be triggered in customers when employees' display humanic factors (such as friendliness and courtesy) and when they provide hedonic benefits, which can lead to customer delight. Upon reviewing the literature, Torres and Kline (2013, p. 644) summarized three ways to attain customer delight:

4

The confirmation-disconfirmation theory suggests that customers are delighted when their expectations are exceeded and, thus, emphasizes customer attitudes. The human needs approach to customer delight emphasizes that service providers can attain customer delight by fulfilling various human needs, especially those that are intangible; Ekini et al. (2008) further state that customer delight needs to be individualized based on the customer's needs and personality. Finally, the affect-based theories emphasize the role of emotions in attaining customer delight.

Customer delight is an accurate indicator of long-term customer relationships because it is a highly affective component, which often results from exceptional service, high customer involvement, continuous service innovation, and the fulfillment of customers' intangible needs. Together, these factors stimulate strong positive emotions in customers and leave vivid and long-lasting memories in their minds while building enduring emotional bonds.

2.2 Service Abilities and Attributes of Delightful Service

2.2.1 Professional knowledge and technical skills

The satisfaction of customers' needs is the fundamental pillar of delightful service. Therefore, service employees must be equipped with sufficient professional knowledge and skills to provide efficient and effective service to respond to customers' requests. Cheng and Wong (2015, p. 123) cited Pizam's (2007) definition of service employees' professionalism as follows:

> An amalgamation of an array of appearance and behaviors, an assortment of technical and conceptual skills, a commitment to maintain competence in a given body of knowledge, and a set of internalized character strengths, values, and attitudes directed toward high-quality service to others, concern for others, respect for the rule of law, and commitment to excellence.

Ap and Wong (2001) proposed three dimensions of employees' professionalism: impressive product knowledge, effective communication skills, and the right attitude (i.e., service oriented). Cheng and Wong (2015) proposed that employees' competence and skills are among the six dimensions of service employees' professionalism and claimed that service employees' professionalism is highly

industry specific. For the hospitality industry, two aspects of the competence and skills of service employees are classified, namely job-related skills and knowledge and interpersonal skills.

To summarize, service personnel should be equipped with sufficient industry and departmental knowledge, must perform services with perfection and precision, must have effective communication skills, and must be flexible and able to react quickly to deliver delightful service.

2.2.2 Customer-oriented behaviors.

To successfully deliver delightful service, the attitudes of service staff are pivotal. "Service orientation" (Hogan, Hogan, & Busch, 1984), "service predisposition" (Lee-Ross, 2000), and "customer (service) orientation" (Brown, Mowen, Donavan, & Licata, 2002) are terms that have been used to describe the attitudes of service employees. According to Saxe and Weitz (1982), customer orientation is the willingness of service providers to customize their service delivery according to customers' situations (e.g., needs, problems, and special circumstances). Kuo, Chen, and Lu (2012, p. 945) claimed "employees with service orientation are apt to be helpful, considerate, dependable, and likeable to meet customers' needs in an on-the-job context." The constituents of service employees' customer-oriented behaviors have been widely studied. For instance, the empathy dimension of SERVQUAL (service quality) (Parasuraman, Zeithaml, & Berry, 1988) emphasizes the importance of understanding customers' needs and the accessibility of services for customers. Berry et al. (2006) proposed that welcoming, comforting, accompanying, inviting, sensing, and conversing are key humanic roles. Pullman and Gross (2004) claimed that "satisfactory encounters result when contact employees make customers 'feel unique or pampered' (Bitner, 1990) by giving them special attention, being attentive, and taking extra time."

Arnold et al. (2005) identified five behaviors in customer-oriented salespeople, namely interpersonal efforts (being helpful), interpersonal engagement (being especially friendly and nice), problem resolution (being willing to go beyond established rules to solve customers' problems), interpersonal distance (not being too aggressive or pushy), and time commitment (taking extra time for customers). Lee (2014) proposed that for service personnel to develop adequate professionalism, they need to be equipped with sufficient service quality efficacy, including a functional dimension associated with the accuracy and credibility of service provided and an

interactive dimension, which involves the conviction of employees to service according to various customer needs. Winsted (2000a, b) proposed three dimensions of customer-oriented behavior. The first dimension relates to concern, namely empathy, assurance, responsiveness, authenticity, listening, and dedication. The second dimension relates to employees' civility, and the third dimension, congeniality, relates to behaviors such as smiling and being cheerful and enthusiastic.

2.2.3 Observation skills and abilities to detect customers' emotional needs

The researchers believe that to deliver unforgettable service experiences, service employees must address customers' hidden emotions and unexpressed needs. Arnold and Price (1993) claimed that "the most successful service providers are those who can read consumers' emotional expressions and adapt accordingly." The pertinence of service employees being able to detect customers' hidden emotional conditions and needs to deliver delightful service has been emphasized in recent studies. During service encounters, customers may not only expect service providers to provide products or services that meet their requirements or expectations but also to anticipate service responses to appropriately address their emotional states and needs. According to Menon and Dube (2000, p.290), "the experience and expression of a given emotion is accompanied by explicit expectations of interpersonal responses that help the person manage or cope effectively with emotions and contribute to the person's well being." They also suggested that appropriate service responses to customers' emotional states affect customer satisfaction: "because customers hold normative expectations for salesperson response to their emotions, greater CS [customer satisfaction] will result if the observed salesperson response positively disconfirms these expectations."

Recent studies have examined the concept of providing services that meet customers' emotional conditions and needs. For instance, a study by Wang and Beise-Zee (2013) revealed that customers need more flexible service offerings that respond to their emotional states at different times and occasions. If service providers can identify customer's emotional states and adjust their service responses accordingly, higher customer satisfaction and loyalty, as well as higher job performance, can be obtained. Bowen (2016) advocated that employees' ability to identify customers' needs is the major driver of a company's service innovations. Tung (2012) suggested that "service intelligence" is an essential component for delivering impressive service. Service intelligence is defined as the ability of service employees to detect customers'

hidden needs before, during, and after service encounters and to provide appropriate service accordingly (Tung, 2012). Service intelligence consists of two aspects: social awareness, which relates to a person's ability to be empathetic, to listen to others, and to understand others' opinions and feelings and social facility, which relates to a person's ability to correctly comprehend unspoken needs, to proactively address other people's needs, and to react appropriately to form hospitable interactions (Tung, 2012). Therefore, customers' emotions are no longer a hidden agenda that were previously considered irrelevant to service offerings; instead, they are another valuable source for which service employees need to pay more attention to and another opportunity for service providers to deliver surprisingly pleasurable experiences and thus achieve customer's long-term loyalty.

2.2.4 Cross-functional coordination abilities

To deliver seamless service that delights customers, it is also pivotal that service employees work as a team and skillfully coordinate with other departments. Hotel guests often require services that involve the joint effort of different departments. Service employees must cooperate with various colleagues to effectively utilize cross-functional or cross-departmental resources to satisfy customers' needs. As Ma and Qu (2011) proposed, hotel employees do not work independently. High-quality service relies considerably on teamwork. Cheng and Wong (2015, p.129) explained that "teamwork and interaction among every single unit in a hotel is key to achieve professionalism given the collective nature of the hospitality industry." Lee, Teng, and Chen (2015, p. 414) also delineated that "hotel industry employees typically interact with customers face-to-face and require additional support and cooperation from their coworkers to satisfy customer needs." Lewis-McClear and Taylor (1998) defined a team as "a group of people with corresponding skills who are committed to a common purpose and are mutually accountable." Workplace relationships within teams can be divided into leader–member exchanges and team–member exchanges (Lee et al. 2015). According to Dansereau, Graen, and Haga (1975), team supervisors provide resources, work-related information, and psychological support to create a "dyadic" relationship between the leader and each member. A high-quality leader–member exchange often produces relatively high subordinate performance and job satisfaction (Gerstner & Day, 1997). High-quality team–member exchanges encourage members to assist one another and share information, ideas, and feedback (Seers, 1989); therefore, high quality team–member exchanges help improve the job

performance of service employees (Lee et al., 2015). In summary, to seamlessly provide services that delight customers, service employees must be equipped with the ability and personality to work well within a team, to maintain good relationships with superiors and other team members, and to be able to flexibly allocate cross-functional resources. In this way, they will be able to provide the so-called "one-stop shopping" experience to delight customers.

2.3 Organizational Support

Frontline service employees are unquestionably the most critical element in delivering delightful service because they are involved in face-to-face interactions with customers. Every aspect of their behavior, including their skills, attitudes, and level of attentiveness, is carefully scrutinized by customers, with the result dramatically affecting customers' experiences. However, strong and effective organizational support is also pertinent for ensuring that service employees are capable of delivering delightful service.

Organizational support is defined as support and commitment from top management, trust among co-workers, immediate managerial involvement, participation and encouragement in desired values, and open communication channels (Yang, 2010). Companies that have a high level of organizational support possess certain characteristics, namely they develop customer-oriented management and offer managerial support, internal service, information-sharing communication, empowerment, and leadership (Lee & Ok, 2015); they have appropriate recognition and reward systems (Maslach, Schaufeli, & Leiter, 2001); and they empower frontline employees to handle service problems themselves and the entire organization is structured to provide support (King, 1995). Consequently, a high level of organizational support increases employee engagement (Lee & Ok, 2015) and boosts employee commitment to providing superior services. Among the various organizational support mechanisms, the organizational service climate and training methods are most relevant to this study.

2.3.1 Service climate

A service climate is defined as "shared employee perceptions of policies, practices, procedures, and behaviors that are rewarded, supported, and expected regarding customer service and service quality" (Schneider, White, & Paul, 1998, p. 151). In other words, companies that emphasize the importance of providing quality service and that widely spread service-oriented value throughout the organization can

make employees believe that their efforts toward providing superior service will be recognized and rewarded by the company, which will consequently offer career opportunities within the company. Therefore, the employees will strive to deliver high-quality service, which improves the service quality of the company. According to Ling, Lin, and Wu (2016), when a company has a positive service climate, its employees are inclined to believe in the importance of customer service and try to do their utmost for customers to adapt to high service settings. Therefore, employees working in companies with a positive service climate may exhibit service-oriented behaviors (customer-oriented behaviors), defined as "the extent to which employees engage in continuous improvement and exert effort on the job on behalf of customers" (Peccei & Rosenthal, 1997, p. 69). Donavan et al. (2004) also indicated that in companies with a customer delight culture, employees often possess customer-oriented values and display behaviors such as pampering customers, reading customers' needs, maintaining relationships with customers, and delivering the desired services. Therefore, we regard a service-oriented climate as an internal drive for fostering service employees' attitudes regarding delightful service. Without a service-oriented climate, service employees would not regard delightful service as essential and would therefore lack the motivation to deliver it.

2.3.2 Training methods

Frontline service employees require constant training to refine their service skills so that they are able to provide services that satisfy or even delight customers. Aforementioned, service skills (e.g., observation skills, proactively providing appropriate services, and establishing emotional bonds with customers) and attitudes (e.g., empathy, proactiveness, and attentiveness) required to deliver delightful service are difficult to teach in traditional classroom settings. The researchers believe that for employees to develop the professional abilities and attitudes required to deliver delightful service, they must learn from role models. Hence, coaching and mentoring are believed to be the ideal training methods for enabling senior employees to impart their knowledge and skills to junior employees. Mentoring is defined as a work relationship between a mentor (an older, more experienced person) and a mentee (a younger, less experienced person) that is formed to facilitate career and personal development (Kram, 1985). Other scholars (Haggard, Dougherty, Turban, & Willbanks, 2011; Underhill, 2006) have defined mentoring as a process in which a superior or senior employee helps a less experienced employee in adapting to an

organization's culture, in performing tasks more effectively, or by developing a more promising career trajectory.

Coaching has a similar training effect. Krazmien and Berger (1997, p. 5) defined coaching as "the ongoing process of assessing employee performance and providing constructive feedback for the purpose of clarifying performance standards and motivating employees to improve current job performance." Krazmien and Berger (1997) specified that coaching involves managerial assistance, guidance, or instruction that focuses on employees' specific performance deficiencies. With senior employees' constantly monitoring junior employees' performance and providing instant feedback, junior employees may learn the skills required to deliver delightful service. In summary, mentoring and coaching both provide a dyadic learning mechanism that enables less experienced junior employees to closely observe senior employees performing their jobs and interacting with customers. From this process, junior employees may learn the professional skills and attitudes required to deliver delightful service. Conversely, when junior employees perform job tasks, senior employees can supervise and provide instant feedback to improve their performance.

3. Research Methodology

3.1 Research Participants and Data Collection

As mentioned, few studies have examined methods for effectively training service personnel to deliver delightful service. As Creswell (1998) suggested, qualitative study is an appropriate research method for examining unexplored topics. The current study used semistructured in-depth interviews as a research method. By conducting in-depth interviews, the researchers acquired a thorough understanding regarding participants' life experiences and therefore developed a theoretical understanding of effective training methods for developing service experts. Ten interviews were conducted with experienced butlers and HR training managers from five-star hotels in Taiwan from July to September in 2017. The interviews gathered participants' insights and experiences regarding their journey to becoming service experts. Each interview lasted approximately 90 minutes in a hotel meeting room and was recorded with participants' consent to avoid losing pertinent information.

Hotel butlers or executive floor service personnel are especially qualified for this research because they are senior and experienced staff who often deliver outstanding service and are designated to serve important hotel guests. Consequently,

hotel butlers are service experts who know how to delight customers. Learning from their journey to becoming service experts, we believed that we would discover effective methods for training exceptional service employees. Furthermore, HR training managers at five-star hotels were recruited as a second group of interviewees. They were responsible for training and maintaining quality service personnel. They contributed to this study because they were familiar with the hotels' training and support systems. Overall, seven hotel butlers and three HR training managers were recruited from four of the most renowned five-star hotels in Taiwan. These participants were introduced through personal connection of two researchers in this study who had over a decade working experience in five-star hotel industry. The interviewees' background information is presented in Table I.

(Insert Table I here)

The interview questions for the hotel butlers mainly focused on acquiring information regarding their work practices, the necessary professional abilities and attitudes required to deliver delightful service, and their learning and training experiences that enabled them to become service experts. The interviews with the HR training managers were centered on hotel training and the support mechanisms that help foster exceptional service employees.

3.2 Content Analysis

To analyze the data collected from the 10 interviews, the contents were first transcribed by two research assistants and the correctness of the transcriptions was verified by a researcher. Three researchers carefully read the interview transcripts and then independently coded them in three phases: open, axial, and selective coding (Corbin & Strauss, 1990). After the three independent coding procedures were completed, the researchers gathered several times to discuss their findings. All disagreements were resolved by referring to the raw data until a consensus was reached.

4. Discussion

With decades of research, we now have a relatively clear understanding of the concept of customer delight and the services that delight customers. Several

conditions have been identified in services that delight customers, namely responding appropriately to customers' emotional states and needs (Bowen, 2016; Kim & Mattila, 2010; Wang & Beise-Zee, 2012, 2013; Tung, 2012); taking initiative and exceeding expectations to provide one-stop service (Gremler & Gwinner, 2000, 2008; Arnold et al., 2005); providing customized service to respond to each customer's situation (Bitner, 1990; Bitner et al., 2000; Mattila & Enz, 2002); and displaying rapport and warm-hearted behaviors to build emotional bonds with customers (Gremler & Gwinner, 2000, 2008; Kahle, 2008; Wang & Beise-Zee, 2012, 2013). To successfully deliver the aforementioned standards of delightful service, well-trained service employees with proficient service skills and the right attitude are of the utmost importance. Therefore, this study aimed to discover both the abilities and attitudes required by service employees to deliver delightful service and the effective training methods to foster exceptional service employees.

4.1 Service Employees' Ability to Deliver Delightful Service

In this study, three levels of abilities were deemed as essential for delivering delightful service: professionalism, the ability to respond to emotions and build bonds with customers, and the ability to provide a one-stop service.

4.1.1 Level 1 ability: professionalism

The level one ability (professionalism) related to company and department-specific operational knowledge and skills as well as a customer-oriented service attitude. Hennig-Thurau (2004) described similar abilities (technical skills), which relate to the knowledge, expertise, and competency employees require to serve customers' needs during service encounters. Even though these abilities are the fundamental requirement for service employees to be able to perform their jobs successfully, performing these daily routines to a level of perfection distinguishes extraordinary service from ordinary service. One butler stated the following:

> *"Smiling and making eye contact are the most basic requirements for every hotel front-line service personnel, but not everyone can perform them well. A person can smile in several different ways, such as regular smiling, laughing, grinning, guffawing, and chortling. An experienced service employee needs to know when to use each kind of smile without sending the wrong impression to customers. Besides, having sincere and warm eye contact is also an extremely important service element that is required by customers. But what does*

sincere and warm eye contact mean? It means that you need to bring customers into your heart, cherish them, and treat them as your loved ones and show those affections through your eyes. These basic skills require many years of practice to master them." (Butler 7)

As mentioned, professionalism in this study comprised two elements: operational knowledge and service skills as well as a customer-oriented service attitude.

4.1.1.1 Operational knowledge and service skills

Service employees who deliver delightful service are often required to be very knowledgeable regarding their products and services to answer their customers' questions, to be very resourceful to provide needed service and to deliver services with perfection. This finding agrees with that of Cheng and Wong (2015) who claimed that employees in the hospitality industry need to have thorough operational knowledge and possess the core skills of their respective department. The participants consistently mentioned that sufficient operational knowledge and professional service skills were pertinent and necessary for delivering high-quality service.

Service employees need to be familiar with every department's products, current events, and nation-specific news, they need to be masters at the reception and in table service etiquette, and they need to have superior interaction skills and an elegant communication style. (Butler 2)

4.1.1.2 A customer-oriented service attitude

In addition to operational knowledge and service skills, a customer-oriented service attitude is the other part of a service employee's professionalism. The hotel industry is the leader of the service industry. It has especially high standards regarding employees' service attitudes. Various elements of a service attitude have been proposed. For example, Hasin et al. (2001) discussed several key behaviors that are positively associated with customer satisfaction, namely effective communication skills, courtesy, attentiveness, personalization, sensitivity, and competence. The participants consistently emphasized the important of service staff having a customer-oriented service attitude. They stated that a friendly and hospitable attitude is a fundamental requirement for people who wish to work in the service industry. Service

employees who lack the right attitude often receive the most customer complaints. Some of the participants believed that a person's attitude is the most pertinent recruitment criterion because technical skills are trainable but a person's attitude is not. Several key attitudes were suggested as being essential for delivering delightful service.

Service is all about a sincere heart and an interpersonal warmness. An excellent service employee must possess a high level of passion and enthusiasm for both the customers and job. Only with a high level of passion and enthusiasm can a person totally concentrate on constantly improving his or her job performance and be sincerely devoted to serving customers. (Butlers 6)

We often find that an employee with a high level of passion and enthusiasm is more willing to proactively discover customers' hidden needs, to provide helpful service, and to take the initiative to establish relationships with customers. (Training manager 3)

A fine service employee needs to be more outgoing, vivacious, cheerful, and needs to find it easy to establish relationships and start conversations with customers. These attitudes are helpful in assisting a person to easily create a joyful vibe among coworkers and customers. (Butlers 3)

4.1.2 Level 2 ability: responding to emotions and building bonds

Professionalism is the fundamental ability that enables service personnel to deliver services flawlessly to satisfy customers' basic needs. However, other abilities are required for more advanced and sophisticated service. The second level ability proposed in this study was the ability of service employees to respond to emotions and build bonds with customers.

4.1.2.1 Ability to respond to emotions

As mentioned, delightful service often requires service employees to not only provide services that satisfy customers' basic and apparent needs but also to respond to customers' emotional states and hidden needs. Kang and Hyun (2012, p. 773) indicated that "the COSE [customer-oriented service employee] who can read customer emotions is likely to increase customer satisfaction through empathizing

with customers' emotional states." Hemmington (2007) and Lashley, Morrison, and Randall (2005) have asserted that service provisions that delight customers require employees to be concerned about their customers' emotional responses in addition to meeting the minimum of their requirements. However, customers' emotional states and hidden needs are not easily detected. Therefore, service employees need to be observant, as suggested by several participants.

Service employees need to be able to foresee what customers may need later by observing the way they talk as well as their eyes, their gestures, and their behaviors, and then they need to proactively provide the needed service. For example, I served the former President a few times. He had a habit of eating a late supper. One time he had an important meeting with government officials in our presidential suite. We were not allowed to be present. There was a small adjoining butler service room, so I stood closely at the door, opened up the door a little bit, and continued to watch the situation in the room. Suddenly I saw the President touch his stomach during the conversation. This gesture gave me the impression that he may be feeling a little hungry. Therefore, I quickly prepared his noodles and sent them to the room. He was surprised and asked how I knew he was hungry. I replied "it's about time." He then happily enjoyed the noodles. (Butler 1)

An excellent service employee needs to observe their customer's preferences and needs in every interaction, and needs to do more thinking and asking before customers even realize their needs or before they ask for something. For example, a customer walks in with flu symptoms without mentioning it. Normally, we give customers a glass of water at room temperature when they check in, but in this case, a sensitive service employee may present this sick customer with a glass of warm lemon water to make him feel better. Another example, a senior receptionist checked in a customer who was chewing gum. She secretly prepared a tissue and handed it over to the customer when he was about to ask for it. This customer was surprised by our receptionist's quick reaction. (Training managers 1)

The level of service we provide is very attentive. For example, in the middle of a meeting, we find out that a guest's pen is running out of ink or his cellphone is out of battery when we go in to refill the water. We will immediately send in a pen or a portable battery. The guest may not ask for the pen or battery, but he or she will definitely be pleasantly surprised by our service. Our butlers need to have this ability to observe everything in great detail. (Butler 5)

4.1.2.2 Bond-building ability

One critical benefit of providing delightful service is that a company can maintain enduring customer relationships by building emotional bonds with them. Various researchers have suggested that interpersonal relationships focus on building relationships and emotional bonds between hosts and customers by stressing ego-support, respect, and thrust, which thus create positive customer experiences (Jensen & Hansen, 2007; Lashley et al., 2005; Teng, 2011). Often the reason for a customer to become loyal to or to frequently return to the same hotel is a sense of familiarity, trust, and a feeling of going back home. Therefore, building emotional bonds with customers and forming a sense of familiarity is pivotal to building long-term relationships with customers, which was confirmed by many of the participants:

Regular guests often ask for the same service person because they feel more secure, and because they will feel that they have returned to a place that they are familiar with. (Butlers 7)

Customers can see the same service employee or the same group of service personnel providing service to them whenever they return. They will experience a sense of familiarity. (Butler 6)

To build emotional bonds with customers and to form a sense of familiarity, service employees need to demonstrate certain service attitudes that convey sincerity, warmness, enthusiasm, and care. The participants regularly mentioned empathy, attentiveness, consideration, and conscientiousness as qualities that service staff need to demonstrate daily.

You need to stand in a customer's mental shoes, regard yourself as that particular customer, and try to think of what he or she might need in this occasion. (Butler 2)

We once had a service failure case. Mrs. Cheng returned from the United States to visit her parents after several years apart. She carefully told our staff "I will arrive late because of the flight schedule. My parents will arrive first, so order for them and serve them meals first. I will order when I arrive. When I arrive, I will say hello to my parents and hug them first. This is a very important family ritual for us. Please do not disturb us at that time." Everything went very smoothly as planned until Mrs. Cheng arrived. During the family ritual, a service person suddenly stood next to Mrs. Cheng and asked "Mrs. Cheng, how would you like your steak?" This simple sentence ruined everything and put Mrs. Cheng in a very awkward position. Does she answer the question first or does she finish the hug with her parents? Mrs. Cheng was furious at us and never came back again. Did this service person ever realize how significant it was to truly understand and feel the importance of this family ritual to that customer? As a service person, you need to learn how to listen and to understand how important certain occasions are to customers and to take it ten times more seriously as being a service person who is responsible for making every service step smooth, on time, and as planned. (Butler 7)

4.1.3 Level 3 ability: providing one-stop service

The ability of service employees to provide one-stop service is similar to concepts proposed in related studies, such as going beyond the call of duty and going out of his or her way to provide attentive service. Gremler and Gwinner (2000) suggested that when an "employee has gone out of his or her way" or "above and beyond the call of duty" to respond to customers' situations or to please them, it delivers a sense of total devotion and a warm-hearted feeling, which creates a pleasurable experience for the customers (Wang & Beise-Zee, 2012), and therefore delights them (Mattila & Enz, 2002; Torres & Kline, 2006, 2013; Wang & Beise-Zee, 2013). However, one-stop service requires more advanced attitudes and abilities. Butlers at hotels often serve very important people (VIPs) who may spend a considerable amount of time traveling and staying in numerous luxurious hotels.

Their requirements for hotels' facilities and services are rigid. Moreover, when chief executive officer (CEO)-level business people travel, they usually have to complete numerous tasks while undergoing tremendous pressure, both physically and mentally. Therefore, they do not want to be distracted by trivial matters involving things such as flight tickets and room problems (Wang and Beise-Zee, 2012). Knowing the mental and physical conditions of CEO-level business travelers, the participants repeatedly mentioned three abilities that they thought were critical for providing seamless one-stop service: the ability to think elaboratively and to respond quickly, the ability to communicate across departments and to coordinate, and the ability to be proactive and to mind someone's business.

4.1.3.1 Elaborative thinking and responding quickly

Unlike ordinary service employees, exceptional service employees tend to think more, plan in advance for their customers, and provide proactive service. One participant stated the following:

> *As for being a fine service person, you are considered to be neglecting your duty when you act upon a customer's request. We usually think before customers and plan and prepare everything they may need before they request it.* (Butler 2)

To deliver the service of this level, service employees need to develop the ability to think elaboratively and to respond quickly. The participants offered the following examples:

> *For example, a customer requests a 5 A.M. wake-up call. We have to start thinking because 5 A.M. is too early for our buffet breakfast, do we need to prepare a breakfast box for the guest? What is the guest's preferred meal? Does the guest need a car to take him or her to the destination? If the guest wants to check out at that time, we need to print out the bill in advance so we will not delay the guest's schedule, etc.* (Butler 2)

> *To work in an executive floor, we need to develop the ability that when a customer asks for A, we need to think about B, C, D, and E. For example, a customer asks us to buy a flight ticket for him. We will start thinking what time*

does he want his flight? Does he need a wake-up call? Does he need a car to take him to the airport? Do we need to prepare a breakfast box for him? If he needs a car, how many people will be going with him? How many suitcases do they have? Can the car fit them all? If the time is early, do they need to settle the bill in advance etc.? We will instantaneously confirm with the customer and prepare everything for him in advance. (Butler 5)

4.1.3.2 Cross-department communication and coordination

Performing seamless one-stop service requires more than the efforts of one service employee; it requires team cooperation. An exceptional service employee is like a coordinator who gathers customers' requirements and distributes tasks to different departments to accomplish the job. Only when coworkers from other departments are also willing to cooperate and deliver services efficiently and perfectly can a service employee successfully deliver delightful service. Consequently, an outstanding service employee needs to develop excellent cross-function or cross-department communication and coordination abilities to establish good relationships with other departments. Good working relationships with other departments often play a key role in enabling service employees to get full support from other departments to fulfill customers' cross-functional requirements.

To do our job well, we need to get familiar with the operations in every department and establish good relationships with each department's managers and assistant managers. When we need help from other departments, they will then be willing to provide their services. (Butlers 3)

A well-functioning butler often requires a senior-level or even a managerial-level service employee who has several years' experiences in the hotel and who is very familiar with the products and operations in every department. And because they have many years' experience working with colleagues in other departments, they often have established good professional relationships. Their relationships enable them to get quicker responses and full support from other departments. For example, two butlers asked a chef to prepare a meal for customers during his spare time at work. The chef may be willing to help one butler but not the other. It all depends on your personal connection and communication skills, which can make a huge difference. (Butlers 4)

4.1.3.3 Being proactive and minding someone's business

  To have the aforementioned abilities at a level of perfection, a service person must be proactive and have a tendency of minding someone's business. Therefore, service employees who have a proactive disposition and who are fond of minding someone's business can easily be trained to delight customers. Several of the participants raised the following point:

  To be an outstanding service employee, you need to have a very important quality, which is minding someone's business. Because you need to be very attentive to take care of everything for the customers, you always need to think more, ask more, and plan everything in advance for the customers. We have some colleagues who have a difficult time meeting our service standards and always complain and say "why do we need to do so much for the customers?" We need to spend a lot of time explaining to them why and may not even be able to successfully change their mindset. Therefore, we try our best to look for candidates who are proactive and are in some way officious during the interview process. (Butler 5)

  Only when you have a proactive character and like to mind someone's business are you willing to do what many other people may not even think about doing. You always want to spend a little more time to do extra for the customers. It is often this extra effort that makes a huge impression on them. (Butler 2)

  The employee we are looking for is someone who is proactive. We want our employees to always keep their eyes and ears open to observe everything that is happening around them and to ask more and think more before our customers even realize their needs. (Training manager 2)

  In addition to having a service attitude toward customers, being proactive and minding someone's business can also apply to service employees' own learning propensity. A proactive service employee who likes to mind someone's business is usually highly self-motivated and can learn more quickly by actively observing, asking questions, and constantly thinking about how to improve his service

performance. Consequently, this type of person tends to deliver more proactive and attentive services, as explained by one participant:

> *As a trainer, I see many types of trainees. Some people only care about completing the assigned task and have no intention of learning more. Some other people, on the other hand, always ask "why" to understand the reason behind things. They always stay vigilant and observe the service style of senior staff or managers. When they see different approaches, they will ask themselves if they can operate the same way in the same situation, instead of ignoring it or pretending nothing happened. This type of person can learn much more quickly and has a higher tendency to care for customers.* (Butler 6)

4.2 Training Methods to Foster Exceptional Service Employees

To flawlessly deliver delightful service, the aforementioned three-level abilities are vital for delivering unique experiences. Therefore, companies that strive to develop their service standards to an exceptional level can easily stand out as being extraordinary. However, how to train and foster high-quality service employees is a key concern for hotel managers. Training service employees has never been an easy task, which is particularly challenging for HR training managers when their companies demand that their staff be customer oriented. Employees can gradually develop the required skills and attitudes with experience. However, because the hotel industry has a high turnover rate, more effective training methods are desperately needed to shorten the knowledge impartation process and to quickly develop qualified service employees who are ready to deliver delightful service.

Generally, hotel training comprises HR training and operational department training. These two types of training have to integrate to create a customer-oriented service climate in the whole organization. The prominence of a service climate is its continuous effect of sending "behavioral signals to the employees about the imperatives of the service setting," as stated by Liao and Chuang (2007, p. 1010). Therefore, by totally immersing employees in a customer-oriented service environment, by them observing the customer-centric attitudes of senior staff daily, and by them being constantly reminded of customer-focused service, junior employees would be able to quickly adopt the same beliefs and display the same attitudes. Therefore, it is proposed that the most effective training method is the development of a customer-oriented service climate in a company. Such an

environment will enable service employees to be naturally molded into exceptional service personnel.

4.2.1 Human resources training.

The HR department in a well-structured, large-scale hotel is responsible for planning and implementing various types of training for employees at different levels. Through this training, hotel employees can regularly improve and update their professional knowledge and skills so that a hotel's service quality can be maintained and improved. Among the different training methods, couple exercises (i.e., role playing and interactive games) are considered very effective for simulating a real service environment and for preparing service employees for situations they will likely face in the future. The HR training managers in this study consistently emphasized that for training to be effective, the employees must "feel" like they are in a real situation.

The classroom method of training is no longer effective for achieving the results we want. The methods we use more today are role playing, playing interactive games and activities, and simulated real-life case studies. We use cases that have happened in real service encounters to let the employees discuss the solutions. We assign two people to a group and we ask one person to be the customer and the other to be the service person. Then, we give them a scenario. For example, "a customer anxiously told a service person today that his daughter was performing in a concert in a foreign country, which he really wished to attend. But his flight had been cancelled." We will ask every group to come up with solutions and to come up to the stage to perform the scenario with their solutions. In this way, everybody can learn several different solutions, can acquire the working experiences of others, and can experience a real-life service problem. (Training manager 2)

In order to create a customer-oriented environment to let employees experience real life situations, the HR training managers in this study said that they regularly convert a classroom into a real service setting and use role playing and interactive games with real-life cases to train their service staff. These training activities inculcate a customer-oriented mentality in the service employees and familiarize them with the service standards they are required to meet in the future.

4.2.3 Operational training

The second phase of training starts when an employee is dispatched to his or her department. A department's on-the-job training usually plays a more vital role than HR training plays in fostering exceptional service personnel, because the training is conducted over a longer period and happens constantly during the employee's work day. Consequently, a customer-oriented service climate must also be formulated within each department to ensure that a customer-centric mindset persists in employees. Coaching and role-modeling are two training methods that have drawn the attention of researchers and industry practitioners, because they are believed to be very effective in building a customer-oriented climate within service teams.

4.2.3.1 Coaching

According to Capozzoli (1993), coaching includes daily guidance and instruction that helps employees improve work performance and build competency. By arranging that senior and junior staffs work on the same shift, senior staff can teach and demonstrate the required service standards and monitor the performance of junior staff and offer suggestions or reminders when appropriate. Therefore, coaching is often praised for its effectiveness in training inexperienced staff.

I find coaching is a very effective method for training employees the more advanced service skills like observational skills. For example, today we had a customer who brought a baby stroller but didn't request any baby related accessories. This junior staff just finished the regular check in process and sent the customers to their room as usual. I later asked him if he saw the baby stroller. I asked, "Will they need a baby cot, a baby bath tub, or other related baby stuff?" He then realized his mistake and said, "Oh, yes." Next time he sees customers with babies, he will pay more attention to those details. Coaching allows me to stand by, to closely watch the mistakes junior employees make, and to promptly remind them of the better service practices and to share my experience with them. (Butler 2)

To develop a customer-oriented mindset in the employees is a very challenging task. But we accomplish this task by exercising peer pressure. Trainers or managers can take advantage of the trainee's mistakes and share other employees' best practices when faced with the same situation. This

enables the junior staff to learn how well other employees serve customers, and they can also learn what to do next time when the same situation happens. Other employees' best practices encourage employees to strive harder to deliver better services. Therefore, we use peer pressure to train our employees' customer-oriented attitude. (Training manager 3)

4.2.3.2 Role-modeling

Rich (1998, p. 55) suggested that "sales coaches must do more than just talk – they must also lead by example, and thus serve as a role model for their subordinates." Scholars have suggested that individuals learn by emulating the attitudes, values, and behaviors of role models deemed credible and attractive (Brown & Trevino, 2006; Hunter, Neubert, Perry, Witt, Penney, & Weinberger, 2013). The benefits of role-modeling are two-fold. First, role-modeling enables a detailed observation of the technical skills and professional attitudes of senior staff, which facilitates the learning process for junior employees. Moreover, a customer-oriented service climate can be built by the regular performance of senior staff, which can have a profound influence on fostering a customer-oriented attitude in junior staff. Therefore, to effectively build a customer-oriented service climate, trainers' actions are more pertinent and effective than their words are.

How do we train new staff to be attentive? We, senior colleagues and managers, must first set an example. We need to demonstrate attentive behavior when we interact with customers as well as with colleagues. We also need to constantly remind each other to be considerate and to try to create an attentive working environment so that everybody can form the habit of being attentive. (Butler 1)

The most effective training method is to create an environment. Managers must set an example by demonstrating the required attitudes when interacting with customers and with colleagues. If everyone in the team practices the same rules and demonstrates the same attitudes, new staff will know this is how the job gets done here and they will get used to the service standards more quickly and easily. (Butlers 5)

5. Implications

The results from this study contribute to the literature on delightful service by consolidating the elements of the abilities and attitudes service employees need to deliver delightful service. By inclusively reviewing the literature on customer delight and delightful service and by conducting in-depth interviews with 10 service experts, this study confirmed three levels of service skills and attitudes that are required to deliver delightful service, namely professionalism, the ability to respond to customers' emotions and to build bonds with them, and the ability to provide one-stop service. Numerous studies have acknowledged that only by building emotional bonds with customers and providing unique consumption experiences can a company stand out in the minds of their customers, which leads to customer loyalty. Outstanding service employees are a key attribute in delivering delightful service. Because customers have become more demanding and sophisticated, only by providing proactive, attentive, and customized service can a company make a positive impression on customers. Therefore, delivering exceptional service that delights customers requires service employees to have skills beyond the traditional reactive style of service. The proposed three-level service abilities and attitudes provide a comprehensive overview of the abilities service personnel need to deliver delightful service and therefore contribute to the body of knowledge on delightful service. The proposed three-level service abilities and attitudes also have profound managerial implications. These abilities provide practical guidelines for training and recruitment to improve the quality of HR in companies and to help ordinary service companies to become exceptional service providers.

The results regarding effective training methods for fostering exceptional service employees also contribute to the literature on delightful service and HR management, because few studies have investigated this aspect of customer service. In line with previous research results on customer-oriented service climates (Liao & Chuang, 2007; Ling et al., 2016; Peccei & Rosenthal, 1997; Schneider et al. 1998), the participants agreed that the most effective training method in a service company is to immerse junior employees in a customer-oriented service environment. Through several effective training methods, namely role playing, playing interactive games, and coaching and role modeling, customer-oriented attitudes and behaviors can be naturally formed in junior staff in combination with the daily observation of senior staff's skills and attitudes. Moreover, the hospitality industry can benefit from the findings in this study because scholars have suggested that developing a customer-

oriented attitude in employees is still a major challenge for management in service industries (Carter & Baghurst, 2014; Ghosh & Khatri, 2017; Liden et al., 2014). The findings of this study therefore provide useful guidelines to hotel managers when designing and implementing effective training methods for fostering customer-oriented attitudes in staff to improve service quality.

6. Limitations

This study has some limitations. First, this study centered on the service staff at five-star hotels to learn from their experiences on delivering delightful service and their journey to becoming service experts. The service standards and abilities proposed by the researchers may only be applicable to high-end service providers; price-sensitive customers may not consider those standards and abilities to be necessary. Therefore, the results of this study may not be pertinent to every service organization. Second, due to time restrictions, only 10 butlers and HR training managers were interviewed. Additional studies should consider interviewing a larger number of participants to broaden the scope of effective training methods for service staff.

Reference

Akbar, S. and Som, APM. (2011), "Determinants of customers' loyalty for hospitality industry", *Information Management and Business Review*, Vol. 2 No. 1, pp. 19–25.

Ap. J. and Wong, K.K.F. (2001), "Case study on tour guiding: professionalism, issues, and problems", *Tourism Management*, Vol. 22, pp. 551-563.

Arnold, M.J., Reynolds, K.E., Ponder, N. and Lueg, J.E. (2005), "Customer delight in a retail context: investigating delightful and terrible shopping experiences", *Journal of Business Research*, Vol. 58, pp. 1132-1145.

Arnold, E. and Price, L. (1993), "River magic: extraordinary experience and the extended service encounter", *Journal of Consumer Research*, Vol. 20, pp. 24-45.

Barber, N., Goodman, R. J. and Goh, B. K. (2011), "Restaurant consumers repeat patronage: a service quality concern", *International Journal of Hospitality Management*, Vol. 30 No. 2, pp. 329–336.

Barnes, D.C., Ponder, N. and Dugar, K. (2011), "Investigating the key routes to customer delight", *Journal of Marketing Theory and Practice*, Vol.19 No. 4, pp. 359-375.

Berry, L., Wall, E. and Carbone, L. (2006), "Service clues and customer assessment of the service experience", *Academy of Management Perceptions*, Vol. 20 No. 2, pp. 43-57.

Bitner, M.J. (1990), "Evaluating service encounters: the effects of physical surroundings and employee responses", *Journal of Marketing,* Vol. 54, pp. 69-82.

Bitner, M.J., Brown, S. and Meuter, M. (2000), "Technology infusion in service encounters", *Journal of the Academy of Marketing Science*, Vol. 28 No. 1, pp. 138-149.

Bowen, D.E. (2016), "The changing role of employees in service theory and practice: An interdisciplinary view", *Human Resource Management Review*, Vol. 26, pp. 4-13.

Brown, T.J., Mowen, J.C., Donavan, D.T. and Licata, J.W. (2002), "The customer orientation of service workers: personality trait effects on self- and supervisor performance ratings", *Journal of Marketing Research*, Vol. 39 No. 1, pp. 110-119.

Brown, M.E. and Trevino, L.K. (2006), "Ethical leadership: a review and future directions", *The Leadership Quarterly*, Vol. 17 No. 6, pp. 595-616.

Capozzoli, T. (1993), "Developing productive employees", *Supervision*, Vol. 54 No. 10, pp. 16-17.

Carter, D. and Baghurst, T. (2014), "The influence of servant leadership on restaurant employee engagement", *Journal of Business Ethics*, Vol. 124, pp. 453-464.

Cheng, S. and Wong, A. (2015), "Professionalism: A contemporary interpretation in hospitality industry context", *International Journal of Hospitality Management*, Vol. 50, pp. 122-133.

Corbin, J. and Strauss, A. (1990), "Grounded theory research: procedures, canons, and evaluative criteria", *Qualitative Sociology*, Vol. 13 No. 1, pp. 3-21.

Creswell, J.W. (1998). *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design: Choosing among Five Traditions*, Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage

Crotts, J.C and Magnini, V.P. (2011), "The customer delight construct: is surprise essential?", *Annals of Tourism Research*, Vol. 38 No. 2, pp. 719-722.

Crotts, J., Pan, B. and Raschind, A. (2008), "A survey method for identifying key drivers of guest delight", *International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management*, Vol. 20 No. 4, pp. 462-470.

Dansereau, F., Graen, G. and Haga, B. (1975), "A vertical dyad linkage approach to leadership within formal organizations: A Longitudinal investigation of the role making process", *Organizational Behavior and Human Performance*, Vol. 13 No 1, pp. 46-78.

Donavan, D.T., Brown, T.J. and Mowen, J.C. (2004), "Internal benefits of service-worker customer orientation: job satisfaction, commitment, and organizational citizenship behaviors", *Journal of Marketing*, Vol. 68, pp. 128-146.

Ekini, Y., Dawes, P. and Massey, G. (2008), "An extended model of the antecedents and consequences of consumer satisfaction for hospitality and services", *European Journal of Marketing*, Vol. 42 No. 1/2, pp. 35-38.

Finn, A. (2005), "Reassessing the foundations of customer delight", *Journal of Service Research*, Vol. 8 No. 2, pp. 103-116.

Gerstner, C.R. and Day, D.V. (1997), "Meat-analytic review of leader-member exchange theory: Correlates and construct issues", *Journal of Applied Psychology*, Vol. 82 No. 6, pp. 827-844.

Ghosh, K. and Khatri, N. (2017), "Does servant leadership work in hospitality sector: A representative study in the hotel organizations", *Journal of Hospitality and Tourism Management*, article in press.

Gilmore J.H. and Pine II, B.J. (1999). *The Experience Economy: Work is Theatre and Every Business a Stage,* Harvard Business School Press.

Gremler, D.D. and Gwinner, K.P. (2000), "Customer-employee rapport in service relationships", *Journal of Service Research*, Vol. 3, pp. 82-104.

Gremler, D.D. and Gwinner, K.P. (2008), "Rapport-building behaviors used by retail employees", *Journal of Retailing*, Vol. 84 No. 3, pp. 308-324.

Haggard, D.L., Dougherty, T.W., Turban, D.B. and Willbanks, J.E. (2011), "Who is a mentor? A review of evolving definitions and implications for research", *Journal of Management*, Vol. 37 No. 1, pp. 280-304.

Hasin, M.M.A., Seeluangsawat, R. and Shareef, M.A. (2001), "Statistical measures of customer satisfaction for health care quality assurance. A case study", *International Journal of Health Care Quality Assurance*, Vol. 14 No. 1, pp. 6-13.

Hemmington, N. (2007), "From service to experience: understanding and defining the hospitality business", *The Service Industries Journal*, Vol. 27 No. 6, pp. 747-755.

Hennig-Thurau, T. (2004), "Customer orientation of service employees: its impact on customer satisfaction, commitment, and retention", *International Journal of Service Industry Management*, Vol. 15 No. 5, pp. 460-478.

Hogan, J., Hogan, R. and Busch, C. (1984), "How to measure service orientation", *Journal of Applied Psychology*, Vol. 69 No.1, pp. 167-173.

Hunter, E.M., Neubert, M.J., Perry, S.J., Witt, I.A., Penney, L.M. and Weinberger, E. (2013), "Servant leaders inspire servant followers: antecedents and outcomes for

employees and the organization", *The Leadership Quarterly*, Vol. 24 No.2, pp. 316-331.

Jensen, Ø. and Hansen, K.V. (2007), "Consumer values among restaurant customers", *International Journal of Hospitality Management*, Vol. 26, pp. 603-622.

Kahle, D. (2008), "Seven ways to build rapport with anyone", *The American Salesman*, Vol. 53 No. 9, pp. 12-16.

Kang, J. and Hyun, S.S. (2012), "Effective communication styles for the customer-oriented service employee: Inducing dedicational behaviors in luxury restaurant patrons", *International Journal of Hospitality Management*, Vol. 31, pp. 772-785.

Kim, M.R. (2011), "The importance of customer satisfaction and delight on loyalty in the tourism and hospitality industry", *European Journal of Tourism Research*, Vol. 4 No. 2, pp. 226-228.

Kim, M.G. and Mattila, A.S. (2010), "The impact of mood states and surprise cues on satisfaction", *International Journal of Hospitality Management*, Vol. 29, pp. 432-436.

King, C.A. (1995), "What is hospitality?", *International Journal of Hospitality Management*, Vol. 14 No. 3/4, pp. 219-234.

Kram, K.E. (1985), *Mentoring at Work: Developmental Relationships in Organizational Life*, Scott, Foresman and Company, New York.

Krazmien, M. and Berger, F. (1997), "The coaching paradox". *International Journal of Hospitality Management*, Vol. 16 No. 1, pp. 3-10.

Kumar A., Olshavsky, R.W. and King, M.F. (2001), "Exploring the antecedents of customer delight", *Journal of Consumer Satisfaction Dissatisfaction and Complaining Behavior*, Vol. 14, pp. 14-27.

Kuo, C.M., Chen, L.C. and Lu, C.Y. (2012), "Factorial validation of hospitality service attitude", *International Journal of Hospitality Management*, Vol. 31, pp. 944-951.

Lashley, C., Morrison, A. and Randall, S. (2005), "More than a service encounter? Insights into the emotions of hospitality through special meal occasions", *Journal of Hospitality and Tourism Management*, Vol. 12 No. 1, pp. 80-92.

Lee, K.J. (2014), "Attitudinal dimensions of professionalism and service quality efficacy of frontline employees in hotels", *International Journal of Hospitality Management*, Vol. 41, pp. 140-148.

Lee, J. and Ok, C. (2015), "Drivers of work engagement: An examination of core self-evaluations and psychological climate among hotel employees", *International Journal of Hospitality Management*, Vol. 44, pp. 84-98.

Lee, A.P., Teng, H.Y. and Chen, C.Y. (2015), "Workplace relationship quality and employee job outcomes in hotel firms", *Journal of Human Resources in Hospitality & Tourism*, Vol. 14, pp. 398-422.

Lee-Ross, D. (2000), "Development of the service predisposition instrument", *Journal of Managerial Psychology*, Vol. 15 No. 2, pp. 148-160.

Lewis-McClear, K. and Taylor, M.S. (1998), "Psychological contract breach and the employment exchange: perceptions from employees and employers", in: Paper presented to the Academy of Management, San Diego, August, 1998.

Liao, H. and Chuang, A. (2007), "Transforming service employees and climate: a multilevel, multisource examination of transformational leadership in building long-term service relationships", *Journal of Applied Psychology*, Vol. 92 No. 4, pp. 1006-1019.

Liden, R.C., Wayne, S.J., Liao, C. and Meuser, J.D. (2014), "Servant leadership and serving culture: Influence of individual and unit performance", *Academy of Management Journal*, Vol. 57 No. 5, pp. 1434-1452.

Ling, Q., Lin, M. and Wu, X. (2016), "The trickle-down effect of servant leadership on frontline employee service behaviors and performance: A multilevel study of Chinese hotels", *Tourism Management*, Vol. 52, pp. 41-368.

Ma, E. and Qu, H. (2011), "Social exchanges as motivators of hotel employees' organizational citizenship behavior: the proposition and application of a new three-dimensional framework", *International Journal of Hospitality Management*, Vol. 30 No. 3, pp. 680-688.

Maslach, C., Schaufeli, W.B. and Leiter, M.P. (2001), "Job burnout", *Annual Review Psychology*, Vol. 52, pp. 397-422.

Mattila, A.S. (2006), "How affective commitment boosts guest loyalty (and promotes frequent-guest programs)", *Cornell Hotel and Restaurant Administration Quarterly*, Vol. 47 No. 2, p. 174-181.

Mattila, A.S. and Enz, C.A. (2002), "The role of emotions in service encounters", *Journal of Service Research*, Vol. 4 No. 4, pp. 268-277.

Menon, K. and Dube, L. (2000), "Ensuring greater satisfaction by engineering salesperson response to customer emotions", *Journal of Retailing*, Vol. 76 No. 3, pp. 285-307.

Oliver, R.L. (1999), "Whence consumer loyalty?", *Journal of Marketing*, Vol. 63, pp. 33-44.

Oliver, R.L., Rust, R.T. and Varki, S. (1997), "Customer delight: foundations, findings, and managerial insight", *Journal of Retail*, Vol. 73 No. 3, pp. 311-336.

Parasuraman, A., Zeithaml, V. and Berry, L. (1988), "SERVQUAL: a multiple-item scale for measuring customer perceptions of service quality", *Journal of Retailing*, Vol. 64 No. 2, pp. 12-40.

Patterson, K. (1997), "Delighted clients are loyal clients", *Rough Notes*, Vol. 140 No. 3, pp. 221-234.

Peccei, R. B. and Rosenthal, P. (1997), "The antecedents of employee commitment to customer service: evidence from a UK", *International Journal of Human Resource Management*, Vol. 8 No. 1, pp. 66-86.

Pizam, A. (2007), "Educating the next generation of hospitality professionals", *International Journal of Hospitality Management*, Vol. 26 No. 1, pp. 1-3.

Price, L.L., Eric J. and Arnould, E.J. (1999), "Commercial Friendships: Service Provider-Client Relationships in Context", *Journal of Marketing*, Vol. 63, pp. 38-56.

Pullman, M.E. and Gross, M.A. (2004), "Ability of experience design elements to elicit emotions and loyalty behaviors", *Decision Sciences*, Vol. 35 No. 3, pp. 551-578.

Rich, G.A. (1998), "Selling and Sales Management in Action", *Journal of Personal Selling & Sales Management*, Vol. 18 No. 1, pp. 53-63.

Saxe, R. and Weitz, B.A. (1982), "The SOCO scale: a measure of the customer orientation of salespeople", *Journal of Marketing Research*, Vol. 19, pp. 343-351.

Schneider, B., White, S.S. and Paul, M. (1998), "Linking service climate and customer perceptions of service quality: Test a casual model", *Journal of Applied Psychology*, Vol. 83 No. 2, pp. 150-163.

Seers, A. (1989), "Team-member exchange quality: A new construct for role-making research", *Organizational Behavior and Human Decision Processes*, Vol. 43 No. 1, pp. 118-135.

Teng, C.C. (2011), "Commercial hospitality in restaurants and tourist accommodation: perspectives from international consumer experience in Scotland", *International Journal of Hospitality Management*, Vol. 30, pp. 866-874.

Torres, E.N., Fu, X. and Lehto, X. (2014), "Examining key drivers of customer delight in a hotel experience: A cross-cultural perspective", *International Journal of Hospitality Management*, Vol. 36, pp. 255-262.

Torres, E.N. and Kline, S. (2006), „From satisfaction to delight: a model for the hotel industry", *International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management*, Vol. 18 No. 4, pp. 290-301.

Torres, E.N. and Kline, S. (2013), "From customer satisfaction to customer delight: creating a new standard of service for the hotel industry", *International Journal of Contemporary Hospitality Management*, Vol. 25 No. 5, pp. 642-659.

Tsai, H.J. (1994), *The study on employees' the quality of working life and service attitude held by service employees of department stores, convenience stores, fast food stores and restaurants.* Master Thesis, National Zhongshan University, Taiwan.

Tsai, S.P. (2014), "Love and satisfaction drive persistent stickiness: investigating international tourist hotel brands", *International Journal of Tourism Research*, Vol. 16, pp. 565-577.

Tung, J. (2012), *12 Lessons to ACE Impressive Service*, Taipei: Commercial Press Taiwan.

Underhill, C.M. (2006), "The effectiveness of mentoring programs in corporate settings: a meta-analytic review of the literature", *Journal of Vocational Behavior*, Vol. 68, pp. 292-307.

Wang, Y.C. (2012), *Emotional states of business travelers and service responses: a study in the hotel industry.* Unpublished doctoral dissertation, Asian Institute of Technology, Thailand.

Wang, Y. C. and Beise-Zee, R. (2013), "Service responses to emotional states of business customers", *Managing Service Quality,* Vol. 23 No. 1, pp. 43-61.

Wang, Y. C. and Beise-Zee, R. (2013), "Pre-encounter affective states of business travelers and service responses", *Journal of Hospitality Marketing & Management*, Vol. 22, pp. 634-655.

Winsted, K.F. (2000a), "Patient satisfaction with medical encounters: a cross-cultural perspective", *International Journal of Service industry Management*, Vol. 11 No. 5, pp. 399-421.

Winsted, K.F. (2000b), "Service behaviors that lead to satisfied customers", *European Journal of Marketing*, Vol. 34 No. 3/4, pp. 399-417.

Yang, J.T. (2010), "Antecedents and consequences of knowledge sharing in international tourist hotels", *International Journal of Hospitality Management,* Vol. 29, pp. 42-52.

106年度專題研究計畫成果彙整表

計畫主持人：王怡潔	計畫編號：106-2410-H-041-001-

計畫名稱：感動服務人才培養之研究

成果項目				量化	單位	質化（說明：各成果項目請附佐證資料或細項說明，如期刊名稱、年份、卷期、起訖頁數、證號...等）
國內	學術性論文	期刊論文		0	篇	
		研討會論文		0		
		專書		0	本	
		專書論文		0	章	
		技術報告		0	篇	
		其他		0	篇	
	智慧財產權及成果	專利權	發明專利 申請中	0	件	
			發明專利 已獲得	0		
			新型/設計專利	0		
		商標權		0		
		營業秘密		0		
		積體電路電路布局權		0		
		著作權		0		
		品種權		0		
		其他		0		
	技術移轉	件數		0	件	
		收入		0	千元	
國外	學術性論文	期刊論文		1	篇	Journal of Hospitality and Tourism Management，投稿中
		研討會論文		0		
		專書		0	本	
		專書論文		0	章	
		技術報告		0	篇	
		其他		0	篇	
	智慧財產權及成果	專利權	發明專利 申請中	0	件	
			發明專利 已獲得	0		
			新型/設計專利	0		
		商標權		0		
		營業秘密		0		
		積體電路電路布局權		0		
		著作權		0		
		品種權		0		

		其他	0		
	技術移轉	件數	0	件	
		收入	0	千元	
參與計畫人力	本國籍	大專生	1	人次	本研究帶領一位大專學生進行文獻資料蒐集與整理,參與訪談進行,整理訪談資料並協助報帳流程。教導學生專業學術研究的過程,感動服務的概念,與帳務處理的執行細節等事項。
		碩士生	0		
		博士生	0		
		博士後研究員	0		
		專任助理	0		
	非本國籍	大專生	0		
		碩士生	0		
		博士生	0		
		博士後研究員	0		
		專任助理	0		
其他成果 (無法以量化表達之成果如辦理學術活動、獲得獎項、重要國際合作、研究成果國際影響力及其他協助產業技術發展之具體效益事項等,請以文字敘述填列。)					

科技部補助專題研究計畫成果自評表

請就研究內容與原計畫相符程度、達成預期目標情況、研究成果之學術或應用價值（簡要敘述成果所代表之意義、價值、影響或進一步發展之可能性）、是否適合在學術期刊發表或申請專利、主要發現（簡要敘述成果是否具有政策應用參考價值及具影響公共利益之重大發現）或其他有關價值等，作一綜合評估。

---

1. 請就研究內容與原計畫相符程度、達成預期目標情況作一綜合評估
   ■達成目標
   □未達成目標（請說明，以100字為限）
   　　　□實驗失敗
   　　　□因故實驗中斷
   　　　□其他原因
   說明：

---

2. 研究成果在學術期刊發表或申請專利等情形（請於其他欄註明專利及技轉之證號、合約、申請及洽談等詳細資訊）
   論文：□已發表　■未發表之文稿　□撰寫中　□無
   專利：□已獲得　□申請中　■無
   技轉：□已技轉　□洽談中　■無
   其他：（以200字為限）

---

3. 請依學術成就、技術創新、社會影響等方面，評估研究成果之學術或應用價值（簡要敘述成果所代表之意義、價值、影響或進一步發展之可能性，以500字為限）
   本研究將服務人員提供感動服務所須具備的能力與態度系統性地歸納為3個層級，並提出有效培育服務人員具備提供感動服務的能力與態度的訓練方式。在學術上彌補了人力資源培育方面研究之不足，在實務上則提供飯店產業與服務產業實用的培育方式，以供改善人才培育之機制，以訓練出更卓越的服務人才。

---

4. 主要發現
   本研究具有政策應用參考價值：■否　□是，建議提供機關
   （勾選「是」者，請列舉建議可提供施政參考之業務主管機關）
   本研究具影響公共利益之重大發現：□否　□是
   說明：（以150字為限）